



सत्यमेव जयते

Ministry of Urban Development
Government of India



National Institute of Urban Affairs

NATIONAL HERITAGE CITY DEVELOPMENT AND AUGMENTATION YOJANA - HRIDAY

**TEMPLATE FOR EVALUATION OF EXISTING DETAILED PROJECT
REPORTS**

June, 2015

INDEX

- 1 Executive summary
- 2 Introduction and Project overview
- 3 Evaluation Results
 - Relevance of the project
 - Impact of the project
 - Efficiency-Effectiveness-Economy (3E)
 - Sustainability
 - Design Review
 - Material Review
 - Cost Estimate Review
 - Compliance with City specific bylaws, ASI norms, Building bylaws (if relevant)
 - Other Factors
- 4 Recommendations

1. Executive summary

- HCA need to provide an executive summary of the evaluation of the DPR

2. Introduction and Project Overview

- HCA will provide the background of the proposed project with its intent, timelines, and overall cost, Year of preparation, objective of the DPR, concerned line departments, linked scheme, funding source mentioned, major components and any other relevant information provided in DPR.

3. Evaluation of the DPR

- Because of the uniqueness of the scheme, HCA need to evaluate the given DPR with respect to following (but not limited to) parameters. A narrative description of all the factors shall be provided in this section.

- ✓ Relevance

- Is the right methodology adapted for delivering the project in DPR?
- What value addition, the proposed project in DPR will provide?
- Which type of Heritage asset/site is associated with the project?
- Whom will be benefitted from the the proposed project?
- Did this project answer real needs in the intervention areas?
- Are the objective/outcome of the project is align with HRIDAY Vision?
- Are the project objectives still relevant (If the DPR is old)?
- Any other relevant factor regarding the relevance of the project?

- ✓ Impact

- What will be the impact of the final outcome of the project on the Imagibility of the area?
- What will be the impact of the project on condition of linked infrastructure?
- What will be the Impact of the project on linked Heritage asset/site/property?
- What will be the impact of the project on local livelihood?
- What will be the impact of the project on Environmental factors?

✓ **Efficiency-Effectiveness-Economy (3E)**

1. Efficiency

- What measures were proposed in DPR to ensure effective financial implementation, monitoring and reporting?
- Were the related Risks were taken in to consideration in designing the Proposal?
- Any other factor related to efficiency of the proposed Project in DPR?

2. Effectiveness

- Are the methodologies adapted in the DPR stands effective?
- Are there any new technology/methodology adapted in the DPR to provide better results in terms of Cost, Time or Quality?
- Is the proposed project ensures accountability to beneficiaries.
- How the proposed project will effectively deliver the outcome related to HRIDAY?
- Any other factor related to effectiveness of the proposed Project in DPR?

3. Economy

- Is there any consideration of measures to ensure cost-effectiveness in procurement and implementation in the DPR?
- Is there any opportunity of dovetailing for the proposed project with other schemes?
- Any other factor related to economy of the proposed Project in DPR?

✓ Sustainability

- Will the outcome of the proposed projects be sustainable after completion with respect to its operation and maintenance?
- Will the outcome of the project influence any policy reforms at local or national level?
- Were the projections/forecasts of the population and tourist flow taken into consideration at the time of preparation of DPR?
- Any other evaluation factor which provides sustainability aspects of the DPR.

✓ Design Review

- HCA need to review the design intent of the proposed project in DPR with respect to HRIDAY objective and vision. All the aesthetic/architectural design should be aligned to suitable heritage theme of the area or city specific toolkit.

✓ Material Review

- HCA need to appraise the BOQ items and Material used for the construction in order to maintain the heritage look of the finished product. HCA can suggest the substitute material according to suitability for the project.

✓ **Review of Cost Estimation**

- HCA need to review the provided cost estimates in the DPR with respect to current market rates /respective SORs and variations due to suggested changes in design, Material, specification etc.

✓ **Compliance with City specific bylaws, ASI norms, Building bylaws (if relevant)**

- HCA need to review the proposed project compliance with respect to City specific bylaws, ASI norms, Building bylaws, heritage bylaws etc.

4. Recommendations

- HCA need to provide their recommendations on the proposed project in DPR with respect to its alignment with HRIDAY scheme, ease of execution, Budget, Timeline. Way forward of the proposed project will be dependent on the recommendations provided by HCA and approval by Technical committee and HNEC.

Consultation with City mission directorate and View of CLAMC should also be incorporated in the same.